

YD 268:12.2012b  
A Concurring Abstention to "The Status of "Messianic Jews""  
Rabbis Aaron Alexander and Elie Kaplan Spitz

*This paper was submitted in June 2013 as a concurring abstention to "The Status of "Messianic Jews"" by Rabbis Kassel Abelson and Reuven Hammer. Dissenting and concurring papers are not official positions of the CJLS.*

We commend Rabbis Abelson and Hammer for their final addendum/p'sak to "The Status of Messianic Jews". They state, "**Psak.** In view of the fact (discussed above) that the halakhah has been ambivalent regarding the question of the Jewish status of an apostate and that in certain matters of personal status many (such as Rashi) have indicated that once a Jew always a Jew, we may consider such children to have the same status as the mother – i.e. apostate Jews – *meshumadim*. This status will continue to be passed down through females so that descendants through the female line would be considered apostate Jews and therefore all of the decisions in this teshuvah would apply to them including the method of returning to Judaism. However descendants whose mothers were not Jews or apostate Jews, even if raised as 'Messianic Jews,' would be required to undergo a full conversion process should they desire to become Jews."

While we agree that as a general principle these Jews can--and in many cases, should--be considered *meshumadim*, having been outside the boundaries of our faith (possibly for generations) as delineated in their original paper, we'd like also to leave room for the individual rabbi to determine that someone born to a Jewish mother, or a later descendent, is not to be considered an apostate and needs no further method of returning to Judaism. Such a person may have been raised Jewishly by other Jewish family members, etc.