And you shall teach them diligently to your children”  
Providing a Jewish Education for Children with Special Needs  
YD 245:3  2009  
Rabbi Jay M. Stein

This responsum was unanimously approved by the CJLS on June 4, 2009. (16-0-0)


שאלה
Is the Jewish community obligated to educate Jewish children with special needs?

תשובת
Introduction:
The rabbinic text most interested in education is Passover Haggadah. In it we bring to life the rabbinic dictum הגדת ולך. In the Haggadah the most popular component is the four questions in which the text describes four children, the wise, the wicked, the simple and the child who doesn’t (even) know how to ask. The response to each child prescribed by the text, לפני ידע הברא מלמד, is to meet that child where he/she is. The mandate of retelling of the Passover story does not require the same information or even the same method employed to convey that information. The Torah requests it, the rabbis demand it we ought to execute these responsibilities.

The opening sections of the Shulchan Aruch, in the section of Laws pertaining to the Study of Torah states clearly the requirement to study. Every single Jew is capable of gleaning something, benefiting in some way through Jewish education.

Every Jew is obligated in the study of Torah, whether rich or poor whether healthy or

1. שמות לא enumeration
2. שאול ביכר ראשית ביכר, פרושר קה: פסח תרצ"א, פסח תרצ"א, פסח תרצ"א, פסח תרצ"א.
suffering with ailments, young or very old. Even the poor who have to beg at the doors, whether married with children (or not) is obligated to establish set times for the study of Torah either day or night as it says, “and you shall meditate on it day and night.” (Joshua 1:8)

However, the final sentence of this section reflects the controversial nature of this question. We need not answer the question of whether or not this person actually exists on the spectrum of people with special needs or if this person was simply an analytical type.

And for the one for whom it is impossible to study because he doesn’t know how to study or because of other troubles that he has, he should provide for others to learn.

This ruling of Yosef Caro in the Shulchan Aruch does, however, offer an opportunity to extend a lenient ruling for those families burdened by the overwhelming requirements of caring for a loved one with special needs.

Section 4

One is required to hire a teacher for one’s child to teach him but for his friend’s child he is not required. Rema – they would compel him to hire a teacher for his son and if he is not in the city and he has the financial capacity, if it is possible to notify him, we inform him (of his obligation to do so); and if not you deduct it from his possessions in order to pay for his child’s instruction. (Rambam Hagaot Maimoniot on Mishneh Torah Hilchot Talmud Torah chapter 1)

Jewish education is so important that it becomes the priority of the community. The Shulchan Aruch is making the comment that the burden rests squarely on the parents. However, the community is concerned about its implementation.

At what point does one begin to teach one’s child? From when he begins to speak, we begin to teach him [the passage] (Deuteronomy 33:4), “Moses commanded us the Torah [the heritage of the congregation of Jacob],” and the first verse of the Shema (Deuteronomy 6:4 – “Hear O Israel, the LORD our

3. ibid. ד
4. ibid. ה
God, the LORD alone”) and afterwards one teaches him little by little until the child is six or seven years old and then we bring him/her to a teacher who instructs children.

The Shulchan Aruch is not suggesting capacity for speech is the determining marker for instruction. In fact, we know that one’s capacity for speech is not a determinant for intellectual capability. The emphasis of this section is that all receive a Jewish education.

**Brief History of Special Needs Education Legislation in the United States**
There is much that can be learned from the communities in which we find ourselves that will assist in creating both a theoretical and practical model for how to address our specific goal. In many ways the legislation in the United States of America provides an instructive model for special education.

In 1975, Congress passed the Education for All Handicapped Children Act, better known at the time as Public Law 94­-142, to change what was clearly an untenable situation. Despite compulsory education laws that had been in place nationwide since 1918, many children with disabilities were routinely excluded from public schools. Their options: remain at home or be institutionalized. Even those with mild or moderate disabilities who did enroll were likely to drop out well before graduating from high school…

Public Law 94-142 proved to be landmark legislation, requiring public schools to provide students with a broad range of disabilities - including physical handicaps, mental retardation, speech, vision and language problems, emotional and behavioral problems, and other learning disorders - with a "free appropriate public education." Moreover, it called for school districts to provide such schooling in the "least restrictive environment" possible.

It is also unmistakable that the cost for providing such an education is expensive and requires concerted and creative thinking to resolve. According to the Department of Education,

---

5. see also ורבכ bü שלחן ירך והר דעה סכמ רמה
6. There is an entire field of science devoted to the development of technology that is called electromyogram (EMG) in order to assist individuals carry out meaningful communication by means of the intelligent analysis and interpretation of information derived from signals generated by facial muscles. Clearly, the ability to speak is not necessarily tied to their capacity for thought such as in infants and toddlers. This is true in many different forms of paralysis or aphasia.

7. I have made the connection that “the study of Torah” is the rabbinic terminology used for Jewish education including the study of holidays, even though, today we would also include other subjects such as history, etc. in a full Jewish education.

approximately 6 million children (roughly 10 percent of all school-aged children) receive special education services. Educating those children was expected to cost nearly $51 billion in 2001, according to the Department of Education's Center for Special Education Finance, with the yeoman's share - more than $44 billion - coming from states and local school districts. That, despite the promise made by the federal government in 1975 to cover 40 percent of the additional costs incurred by districts to educate students with disabilities. Even though federal spending for special education continues to rise (from $3.1 billion in 1997 to $6.3 billion in 2001), the federal government has never paid more than 15 percent of the total costs.

Clearly the United States government in addressing the issue of special needs education recognizes as do I, that special needs education is both expensive and necessary.

Terminology and Categories of Learners

Before beginning a conversation about the technical terms our tradition uses to describe people with special needs it is helpful to make mention of the varied terms used today in modern parlance so we remain sensitive to those most closely touched by these issues. The commonly used terms today are “special needs” denoting an individual with significant challenges in learning and social development. “Learning differences” denotes a person with less significant challenges while the term, “on the spectrum” is a reference to individuals who have some diagnosis of autism. People exhibiting normative behavior and cognition are referred to in this context as “typical.” It is, however, important to obtain, through appropriate testing, a correct diagnosis in order to create an appropriate educational plan including setting realistic goals.

In rabbinic tradition the terminology is less subtle. The categories such as שותה רוח and do not apply to this unique cohort. The Shulchan Aruch explains that people who are not as bright as the average person are not considered a שותה רוח. The שותה רוח is mentally ill, that is, a person who suffers from an illness that is chronic in nature. These people are still required to perform שותה gamur (completely insane): perhaps best illustrated by the chronic schizophrenic patient, whose prognosis remains poor and whose baseline functioning is seldom regained.(Rema, Even ha-Ezer 44; Ahi’ezel, Even ha-Ezer 1:10.)

In Rabbi Reuven Hammer’s שותה ת察看 בטוח ו⁄ב ממצוה מילים מפורים he defines שותה as one who is

Shoteh who exhibits ‘itim halim ‘itim shoteh (who cycles in and out of psychosis): (Ketubbot 20a; Yevamot 113b; Nedarim 36a; Gittin 5a, 23a; Rosh ha-Shanah 28a; Palestinian Talmud, Ketubbot 1:25b; Palestinian Talmud, Gittin 2:44a. Note that the Yerushalmi appears to differentiate between halim [incomplete remission] and shapui [full remission] See responsa Rashba 4:201. See also Rambam, Mekhirah 29:5. For example, the manic depressive, or bipolar, patient, for whom the prognosis is generally good and who may be considered sane and competent when not cycling in the psychotic state.

Shoteh le-davar ehad (who is insane in only one domain, remaining sane and coherent in all others): as seen in the contemporary delusional disorder, in which there is a fixed manifestation of non-bizarre delusions involving situations that may occur in real life, such as being followed,
mitzvot. The רוח (deaf-mute) is to be encouraged to maximize their observance to the full extent of their abilities. If a רוח is required to observe mitzvot, there must be an obligation for instruction.

Clearly the statement in the Talmud indicating a correlation between capacity for speech and cognitive ability is not relevant. The thrust of rabbinic directive on this subject is on the requirement to teach Torah, not necessarily the ability of the learner. The scope of this teshuvah focuses on the requirement to teach, that is to offer a Jewish education to all regardless of their capacity to acquire it.

The Talmud does not correlate capacity to learn with requirement to teach. Rabbi Reuven Hammer in his teshuvah Regarding the Issue of Bar/bat Mitzvah Ceremony for children with Special Needs, makes this point. Both Rav Moshe Feinstein and Rabbi Simhah Bunam rule that a child with special needs is required to perform mitzvot when he reaches the chronological age of Bar Mitzvah. It would therefore follow that a child must receive instruction (Jewish education) if they are to properly perform the mitzvot.

poisoned, infected, deceived, diseased, etc. This individual, despite remaining psychotic in a specific area, may be adjudged competent to engage in certain other domains of responsibility and obligation that would otherwise remain off limits to other shotim.

For more on this subject please see http://www.daat.co.il/daat/kitveyet/assia_english/strous-1.htm. This article was written by Rael Strous, M.D., Senior Psychiatrist, Be'er Ya'aqov Mental Health Center, Sackler School of Medicine, Tel Aviv University

ASSAI - Vol IV, No 1 February 2001

10. שולחן ערוך ארוח חמש טפין טפין

11. אמר מר וסרו: כר ב_splits艦 למלמד. בר אש אמר: דרא למלמד והא, דא סלקא דעתך

12. Iggerot Moshe OH 2:80, 3:55, 4:84 and 4:90

13. Said Mar Zutra, read, That they may teach. R. Ashi said: Assuredly it is [to be read]: That they may teach. For if you suppose [that it should be read]: That they may learn, and [argue that] if one cannot talk one cannot learn (and [obviously] if one cannot hear one cannot learn), that follows from [the expression]: That they may hear. Therefore, it must certainly be [read]: That they may teach.
Rabbi Reuven Hammer’s *Teshuva on Bar/Bat Mitzvah of children with special needs* states,

In the Responsa Shevet Sofer, Even HaEzer 21, Rabbi Simhah Bunim Sofer writes that a retarded (“learning disabled” – pc) child is obligated in [observing] the commandments at age thirteen just like every other child. Rabbi Moshe Feinstein reaches the same decision.

Rabbi Hayim Pinhas Sheinberg reaches the conclusion that “learning disabled children – with therapy appear like those [children] having cognition that understand contradictory matters and that they, as thirteen year olds, are obligated for all the commandments like other adults.

And Rabbi Shlomoh Zalman Auerbach, in agreeing with Rabbi Sheinberg, goes further when stating that if the child has “cognition like toddlers that God (lit. “The Holy One, Blessed Be He”) gave us the Torah and that we are fulfilling His commandments, he (the learning disabled child) is like an individual with knowledge concerning the fulfillment of the commandments.

Though the terminology is particularly distasteful to our modern sensibilities, the message is the same. Different people learn at different speeds and depths. Through the sensitive reading by Rabbi Moshe Shapira, Moses becomes an example of what can be achieved through more appropriate pedagogical methodologies.

To bring tipshim14 to learning. Those who forget their learning. It should never be said, “Why do we teach certain children who appear not to be able to comprehend the material?” The answer is derived from Moses. He diligently continued to learn in spite of his constant forgetfulness. And, at the very end he acquired it.15

Qualitative/Quantitative/Immeasurable/Unexpected Results: A False Mindset

We often fall into the mindset that learning must be based on quantifiable results. This is
patently false. Though Jewish education has three desired results, only one is in any way quantifiable.\textsuperscript{16} We often falsely believe that the sole purpose of education is to convey information. Material, dates and facts seem to be the sole focus of the educational enterprise. While they may true of many educational experiences, such as math and science, that cannot and should never be the sole purpose of the study of Torah.

Torah is taught with three results in mind. 1. Quantitative results - learning Torah so that one can perform mitzvot. וְלָמְדוּ תְהֵרָה עַשְׂשָׂתָם, then you will remember and you will do.\textsuperscript{17} 2. Qualitative results - we learn so that we might grow personally and find a measure of fulfillment. This is given expression by the statement, “Rav said the commandments were given in order to refine people through them - אמר רב לַא נַתַּן הַמִּצְצָמִית אֶלָּא הָעָלָה וְיִרְבּוּ מִמֶּחֶם.”\textsuperscript{18} and 3. Immeasurable results, such as learning as a means towards connection with God. “In order for people to become involved in doing commandments and thereby attach to Him.” מְחַהֵה עֵסָק בְּהֵרָה בְּמִשְׁמָרָה וּבְרָאשָׁתָה כְּהַגֵּדֶד וּבְרָאשָׁתָה.\textsuperscript{19}

There is no minimum requirement for capacity for learning to be associated with teaching (and for the sake of this responsum, providing a Jewish education for) those with a diminished capacity for comprehension.\textsuperscript{20} All of these categories of learning speak to the transformative capacity of learning, while at the same time recognize that there is no way to measure the change that has occurred within the individual.

Finally, within the educational endeavor there are lessons that are taught that often have little to do with the material that is being transmitted consciously. For Jewish education, seeking emotional and intellectual growth (including formation of identity), and further connection to God and community, inclusion of students with special needs will have a concomitant value of shaping the lives of the fellow students and instructor alike. The common reading of the text from Mishnah Avot of the statement

בֵּן יָמָה אָמַר אֲבֵן חוּק. הַלּוֹמֵד מֶלֶךֶּה וַאֲבֹד. שֶׁאָמַר (הָהָלָךְ כּוּן), מֶלֶךֶּה מֶלֶךֶּה הַשׁכָּלֵלִי יִדְוֹרֵד שֵׁיתָה.

BEN ZOMA SAID: WHO IS HE THAT IS WISE? HE WHO LEARNS FROM EVERY PERSON, AS IT IS SAID: FROM ALL WHO TAUGHT ME HAVE I GAINED

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{16} This idea is developed in an essay by Rabbi Mosheh Taragin (faculty member of Yeshivat Har Etzion) entitled, \textit{“Torah Education and its Pivital Role within Chinuch,”} available at http://www.haretzion.org/alei/1-7edu.htm
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{17} This idea is developed in an essay by Rabbi Mosheh Taragin (faculty member of Yeshivat Har Etzion) entitled, \textit{“Torah Education and its Pivital Role within Chinuch,”} available at http://www.haretzion.org/alei/1-7edu.htm
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{18} This idea is developed in an essay by Rabbi Mosheh Taragin (faculty member of Yeshivat Har Etzion) entitled, \textit{“Torah Education and its Pivital Role within Chinuch,”} available at http://www.haretzion.org/alei/1-7edu.htm
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{19} This idea is developed in an essay by Rabbi Mosheh Taragin (faculty member of Yeshivat Har Etzion) entitled, \textit{“Torah Education and its Pivital Role within Chinuch,”} available at http://www.haretzion.org/alei/1-7edu.htm
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{20} There is a statement found in Mishna Avot 5:23 that suggests at certain ages specific types of texts are taught. However, this Mishna does not give a rationale for this curriculum.
\end{flushright}
UNDERSTANDING, WHEN YOUR TESTIMONIES WERE MY MEDITATION.  

Again I draw your attention to the concomitant effect of expanding educational access to those with special needs will have. There are tremendous benefits to the special needs learner, teacher, and fellow students when these three come together in a learning environment. Teachers and students alike learn from the experience, and they each develop in their own way, all the while learning from each other. As one mother of a child with Fragile X remarked, Matthew is a gift that keeps on giving. Rabbi Reuven Hammer explains:

Depriving the child of knowledge of his heritage, of the opportunity to participate fully in Jewish life at home and in the synagogue and of the warmth and significance of synagogue celebrations such as Bar or Bat Mitzvah is unfair, especially to a child who needs every opportunity available to develop feelings of positive self-worth and of belongingness.

An examination of the varied sources within our sacred canon will further support, both in principle and in practical halakhic language, the requirement to provide a Jewish education for all.

Moses our Teacher
Both of our guiding principles as well as specific legal requirements are provided by the Biblical narrative. We are shown people and personalities so that we might identify and refine our lives accordingly. Moses is such an example. Though there are behaviors exhibited in the Torah that we would choose not to emulate, and at times Moses behaves in those ways, in this circumstance Moses offers a model I believe is worthy of imitation. Moses explains that he is unable to lead because of his speech impediment. God responds that God is the creator of all, and therefore, assists people. But more significant than Moses’s example is God’s response to Moses.

And Moses said to the Lord, O my Lord, I am not eloquent, neither yesterday nor the day before, nor since you have spoken to your servant; but I am slow of

---

21. אַבְּעַתִּי של ח"ז

22. Fragile X is a family of genetic conditions, which can impact individuals and families in various ways. These genetic conditions are related in that they are all caused by gene changes in the same gene, called the FMR1 gene. This can have an effect on cognition, behavior, sensory perception, speech and language, motor skills and living skills. For more information see http://www.fragilex.org/html/what.htm

speech, and of a slow tongue. And the Lord said to him, Who has made man’s mouth? Who makes the dumb, or deaf, or the seeing, or the blind? Is it not I the Lord?\textsuperscript{24}

Though this may appear as just an excuse on the part of Moses, it is clear the Rabbis understood Moses in a similar fashion. Moses becomes both an inaccessible role model, a person whom we could never emulate as in the case of

\textsuperscript{24}`iap cer dynk l`xyia mw `l

“never arose in Israel another prophet like Moses,” and a completely human and real person whom we can venture to imitate. Moses was a person with very real differences from a typical learner, as we have already seen.\textsuperscript{`i­ i:c zeny}

The Talmud offers us another insight into both Moses’ learning and God’s response.

\textsuperscript{25}dgkyne dxez cnl did dxda dyry mei mirax` oze` lk opgei iax xn` zeklnl oiie`x l`xyi lk

All Israelites are fit for royalty. Rabbi Yohanan said, “Each of the forty days that Moses was on Mount Sinai he learned the entire Torah and then forgot it. In the end, God gave him [the Torah] as a gift. Why was it necessary? To bring \textit{tipshim} closer to Torah \textsuperscript{25}

Our Sages remind us we are all created \textsuperscript{c"d/ a cenr gn sc b wxt zeixed inlyexi cenlz}, and therefore we each have a unique purpose and a unique role, regardless of our apparent insufficiencies. Rav Yosef Soloveichik explains, “If it is possible for Moses to be chosen as the messenger for the Holy One Blessed be He, it is possible for every single Jew.”\textsuperscript{26} God is able to convey God’s message through whatever agent God chooses, and we are not to be the determinants of who might be that vessel. The second message being conveyed in this comment is that God has the capacity, regardless of the instructor, to assist the learner in comprehending the message that is offered. God works through the speaker to the listener. The assessment that the one appears to be unable to apprehend the material being transmitted may be incorrect.

Though there is much commentary offered throughout the ages about the Shema, the unambiguous statement that we are to teach Torah to our children makes it obvious that no criterion is set for what characteristics must be met for this basic responsibility to apply.

\textsuperscript{26}:jnewae jakyae jxca jzklae jziaa jzaya ma zxace jipal mzppye

\textsuperscript{24}

\textsuperscript{25}rem arkabl y thi s same story i n the Babylonian Talmud (` cenr gl sc mixcp zkqn ilaa cenlz)

\textsuperscript{26}rab yisx zb hly s]\textsubscript{ol}bicin\textsubscript{c}, ym \textsubscript{cbrx}, yr\textsubscript{slm}, 1996. ym, 11
and when you rise up.\textsuperscript{27}

The Shema \textbf{never} says, “you shall teach this to your children only if they are able to understand it.” The text never even implies that there are potential scenarios in which this would not apply. Moreover, the text never suggests what the nature or the content of that education ought to be.

\textbf{Early Detection}

Identifying early learning styles is critically important. The earlier the identification of differentiated learning styles the better for equipping the individual students with the tools necessary for success in the learning environment. For generations many learning challenges have been overlooked, not understood, not recognized, or, worse, ignored. Recognizing this challenges early are some of the ways we help people with learning differences to establish life long patterns. If we are clear that from the youngest age Jewish education is required, we will be teaching two critical lessons: (1) every child should have access, and (2) Every child ought to realize the priority they should place on Jewish learning. Proverbs instructs us:

\begin{quote}
Train up a child in the way he should go; and when he is old, he will not depart from it.\textsuperscript{28}
\end{quote}

We understand the importance of early intervention for children with special needs as critical to their development and that certain children require different modes of instruction. For some education can be frontal; for some, it must be experiential. Some people are auditory learners, some are visual learners, and some are kinesthetic learners. This is what Yehiel Hillel Altshuler (son of David Altshuler, 18th century, Galicia) intuitively understood when he commented,

\begin{quote}
Initiate the child at a young age in the service of the Lord in accordance with his level of intelligence, whether excessive or limited. As a result, when he becomes accustomed to serving God, even when he ages he will not stray because he will come to understand and appreciate these activities.\textsuperscript{29}
\end{quote}

\textbf{The Role of the Teacher - The Teacher Transformed}

Patience and perseverance are required for the education of children with special needs. They are called “special needs” because they require of the educators to rethink their methodology and find an approach that is less common. The story of R. Pereda shows the rewards that come with

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{27}במדבר ה:ז
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{28}משלי כב:ר
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{29}מצוות דוד משלי פרק כב:ז
\end{flushright}
such an effort. Again, it is important to note that this story focuses not on the potential frustration of the student, but rather on the obligation of the teacher. Let me stress again that this is a teshuvah addressing the responsibility to teach, not the capacity to learn as the underlying halakhic requirement.

R. Pereda had a pupil whom he taught his lesson four hundred times before the latter could master it. On a certain day, having been requested to attend to a religious matter, he taught him as usual but the pupil could not master the subject. “What,” the Master asked: “is the matter to-day?” — “From the moment,” the other replied, “the Master was told that there was a religious matter to be attended to I could not concentrate my thoughts, for at every moment I imagined, now the Master will get up or now the Master will get up.” “Give me your attention,” the Master said, “and I will teach you again,” and so he taught him another four hundred times. A bath kol issued forth asking him, “Do you prefer that four hundred years shall be added to your life or that you and your generation shall be privileged to have a share in the world to come?” — “That,” he replied. “I and my generation shall be privileged to have a share in the world to come.” “Give him both,” said the Holy One, blessed be He. 30

The relationship between teacher and student is one in which the focus in on the change that occurs within the student. The intention of the gift of knowledge, kindness and connection is one that normally looks as unidirectional. The teacher gives to the student. This text reminds us that teacher compensation often comes in the form of gifts of the same kindness, connection and knowledge. That compensation comes from the student to the teacher. Educators are changed in the process of engagement with their students. The symbiotic nature of that relationship is made more evident through this text.

Educators may not be able to assess the ultimate impact of any given methodology for a specific type of learner. That is, we have no way to measure the transformative effect of the methodologies employed. Teachers often become discouraged or even disheartened in their efforts to convey material. The Talmud reminds such teachers that they must remain focused on their task and determined in their efforts, for they serve a greater good. The teacher must remember that they too are fulfilling a sacred obligation, one they are uniquely positioned, if not uniquely qualified, to put into action.
Rab Judah said in Rab's name: Whoever witholds a halachah from his disciple is as though he had robbed him of his ancestral heritage, as it is written, “Moses commanded us a law, even the inheritance of the congregation of Jacob:” it is an inheritance destined for all Israel from the six days of Creation.  

The teacher must remember not to measure success based on quantifiable results. New metrics and new approaches must be developed in order that both the teacher and the student can measure achievement.

Maharsha (Rabeinu Shlomo Aderet, 11th Century, Spain), commenting on Sanhedrin 91b, reiterates the importance of teaching Torah to all types of students. He further instructs the teacher to guard against an elitest attitude that might preclude certain students from access to qualified teachers. Maharsha indicates that Torah does not belong to the teacher, and withholding it would be considered a grave offense tantamount to stealing.

There is no doubt that teaching children with special needs requires great patience, skill and insight. It requires advanced education and keen sensitivity. Providing such an education speaks not only to the values of the individual, but to the values of the community that employs such a person. The P’nei Moshe (Rabbi Moses Margalit, circa 1727, teacher of The Vilna Gaon) reminds us,

Why wasn’t it originally given to him as a gift? To bring the *tipshim* closer to learning. Of those who forget their learning it should never be said in the Jewish community, “Why do we teach certain children who appear not able to comprehend this material?” The answer is derived from Moses. He diligently continued to learn in spite of his constant forgetfulness. And, at the very end he...
acquired it.33

Community Responsibility
The responsibility to educate children is one that has always been understood to be shared by parents and the community. The reasons for this is not only to raise up a community of educated people, who will therefore contribute to that community. The values of every community are expressed in the priorities it has. Where a community devotes its resources speaks to the values it holds to be sacred. The education of every person indicates that the community finds each person worthy of education.

You should settle every city with a teacher. And every city that does not have a teacher you should compel the people of that city to acquire a teacher. And if they do not comply, the city should be destroyed, because the world can only survive by the words that come out of the mouths of the children in the house of teachers.

The Shulchan Aruch places the burden of teaching squarely on the shoulders of the community and indicates that teaching children is a clearly a priority. There is no question that the resources we devote to any given population within our community speaks to our priorities. When we choose to dedicate resources to the education of everyone, we make a clear statement about the value we place on every person and the value we place on Jewish education.

Recommendations
I recognize there are many needs in any given Jewish community. Regularly communities must make decisions about the allocation of scarce human and financial resources. There are many resources for how the Jewish community should respond to students with special needs.36 Other
responsa overlap with this one and add nuance and texture to this discussion.\textsuperscript{37}

In his pioneering book, \textit{The Other Child in Jewish Education}, Rabbi Reuven Hammer wrote,

The purpose of this book is to set the basic lines along which this can be done and thus to help the school and the community provide a suitable program within Jewish education for children with learning disabilities. The responsibility of the Jewish community springs from the traditional Jewish emphasis upon the importance of education not only for the elite and the elect, but for everyone. Historically, opportunity for education was provided for the average man by the community. Special children surely deserve no less.\textsuperscript{38}

There must be a mechanism in place to both encourage (financially and otherwise) our schools, both supplemental and day school, to allocate resources towards the development of avenues for special needs children to receive proper education. Camp Ramah has already done it through the Brayrah and Tikvah programs. Now the other branches of our movement charged with educating our children, such as Solomon Schechter Day schools, synagogue schools, and U.S.Y., and Kadima must also respond to this mandate.

\textbf{A Warning}

This teshuvah purposefully does not suggest the methods or the content of what “Jewish Education” should or ought to be; that is the purview of each individual community and their educators. This teshuvah simply seeks to make clear that every student deserves access to Jewish education.

To this end, I make the following specific recommendations:

1. Communities must be brought together to share financial and human resources. If there is ever an issue that has the potential to bring different streams of Judaism together it is this one. There is no question that common ground can be found in the area of curriculum and must be initiated by our movement to mediate those conversations and create these initiatives.\textsuperscript{39}

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textbf{Annual Newsletter of the Consortium So That All May Study Torah: Communal Provision of Jewish Education for Students with Special Needs-} a survey and recommendations JESNA webpage (includes resources for special needs): www.jesna.org http://www.jesna.org/j/pdfs/re_stamst.pdf
\end{itemize}

37. James Rosen, in his responsum "Mental Retardation, Group Homes and the Rabbi" YD 336:1.2000 based on the verse, “If your kinsman being in straits comes under and you hold him as a resident alien, let him live by your side. Do not exact from him advance or accrued interest, but fear Your God and let him live by your side as your kinsman” (Lev. 25:35-36), adds tremendously as well to this discussion.

38. Hammer, page 11

39. Elliot Dorff has already provided a framework for these discussions in his teshuva “Joint Conservative-Reform Schools” Y.D. 245:15, 1988. James Rosen has also added texture to this conversation through
2. Rabbis should take a leadership role in raising money from individual and private donors.
3. Communal lay and professional leaders should lobby the allocation committee of local and national Federations/U.J.C./J.U.F. for funding.
4. Synagogues should attach a voluntary supplement to their dues structure to provide individuals an opportunity to participate in this mitzvah.
5. Schools should apply for grants from Foundations that may be inclined to use their resources in this manner.

Conclusion
We are just beginning to understand how the brain works, and therefore we have no full understanding of what is comprehended or how that information is catalogued. To judge a priori would be to place ourselves in a position not of teachers but of prophet and judge. Many halakhic and aggadic sources point to the fundamental, critical and far reaching requirement to provide a Jewish education to all regardless of capacity.

It is clearly the obligation of both Jewish parents and the community to provide for the Jewish education of all Jewish children, regardless of their social, emotional or intellectual capacity. The type of education that is provided should be determined by the professionals in this area. The field of special needs Jewish education is an ever expanding profession with talented and qualified faculty and administrators. The specifics of the type, breadth and depth of the education that ought to be and can be offered is clearly something they should decide. Jewish institutions ought to pool resources in order to efficiently utilize and allocate support in a non-discriminatory way.

פקס הלכה
קרוחת החרדיםируется לספקי חינוך יודוי לכל ילידי יהודים. יש-controls על כל קרובות הפעילות
לkerja בשבוג בחרות לקרובות הקספים

P’sak Halachah
Every Jewish community is required to provide a Jewish education commensurate with the needs of every student. This is one important duty that every Jewish community must take into consideration in allocating its resources.

Bibliography
Mel Levine, A Mind at a Time. Simon and Schuster: NY 2002

It is with deep gratitude I thank Rabbi Martin Schloss for his insight and scholarship and for talking through the varied issues regarding this topic. As well I thank Rabbis Pamela Barmash, Philip S. Scheim, Daniel Nevins and Hazzan Emanuel Perlman for their meticulous readings and additions.