Y.D. 376:4

Saying Kaddish for Twelve Months, A Valid Alternative.

Rabbi Richard Plavin and Rabbi Mayer Rabinowitz

This responsum was approved by the CJLS on May 28, 2008 by a vote of thirteen in favor, one opposed and three abstaining (10-3-3). Members voting in favor: Rabbi Kassel Abelson, Elliot Dorff, Myron Fenster, Robert Fine, David Hoffman, Aaron Mackler, Avram Reisner, Jay Stein, Loel Weiss, David Wise. Members voting against: Rabbi Jerome Epstein, Adam Kligfeld, Daniel Nevins. Members abstaining: Rabbis Pamela Barmash, Reuven Hammer, Alan Lucas.

שאלה: How long is a child obligated to recite kaddish for a deceased parent? If there are different customs, which one should we follow?

תשובה:

Historical background of kaddish as a prayer for mourners.

The origins of the kaddish are not clear, but it seems to have served as a closing prayer at the end of an aggadic sermon or lesson. It became the conclusion prayer after Torah study at the end of shivah for a scholar, and then later became the concluding prayer at the end of shivah.

The reason for the kaddish becoming a ritual for mourners is discussed by various scholars, and is mentioned in various response. The practice is based upon a legend which appears in varying forms about Rabbi Akiba who helped to redeem the soul of a dead person from the tortures of gehinom.

For the custom of saying kaddish to bring rest to the souls of the departed for the first twelve

2 Abraham E. Millgram, Jewish Worship, pp. 80-81.
3 See above note 1.
4 See above note 1.
5 See above note 1.
6 See above note 1.
months and on every year on the anniversary of their death, I have not found an explicit source in the Talmud, and only in Massekhet Kallah Rabbati is it mentioned: “It happened that Rabbi Akiba came upon a [dead] man carrying a bundle of wood on his shoulder. Rabbi Akiba went and had the son of this man circumcised and taught him Torah and had the son lead the service in the synagogue in order to bless God in the congregation. Sometime later Rabbi Akiba went to that place and the dead man appeared to him saying let your mind be at rest just as you brought rest to my mind.” In Menorat Hamaor this story is mentioned in the name of the Tanhuma with slight differences. In Elyahu Zuta this story is told about Rabbi Yohanan Ben Zakkai as follows: “...I plead with you be careful with him from his birth until he reaches the age of five. Take him to his teacher’s house to study Torah, because when he will say Barkhu et hashem hamevorakh then I will be released from my judgment in gehinom.”

Based on this legend the custom developed of the קדי being recited by minors after the service, because a minor could not lead the service [as was done in these stories, in order for the mourner to bless God amidst the congregation]. But a mourner who was not a minor was expected to lead the service rather than relying on the kaddish.7 Having the people respond יהא רבה was the essence of the ritual, and there was great merit to having a son recite it.8

For Whom Kaddish is recited and for how long.

A study of the various texts concerning the recitation of kaddish by a mourner reveals different customs. The period of time ranges from eleven months to twelve months.

In midrashim we find the custom of reciting the kaddish for a father. Based on these midrashim, the custom developed to recite the kaddish batra10 on behalf of a father or mother, for a period of twelve months. The custom developed for the son to recite the haftara and to lead the evening prayer on motzaei shabbat which is when the souls return to gehinom. And when the son prays and sanctifies God, the son redeems his father and mother from gehinom...and the custom developed that kaddish is recited for only eleven months so that the father and mother don’t appear to be evil, for the judgment of an evil person is twelve months.

The Rema starts by establishing the custom of reciting the mourner’s kaddish for twelve months, and then mentions the custom of reciting kaddish for only eleven months. In fact, various authorities raised questions about the Rema’s statement because it seems to be self contradictory.

---

7. **הגהות הרמ”א** שיע”י רו”ד ס”ע י”ע ס”ע ד הגהות הרמ”א.
8. See TB Taanit 5b, TB Baba Batra 116a and TB Sanhedrin 104a.
9. **ש”י רו”ד** ס”ע י”ע ס”ע ד הגהות הרמ”א.
And regarding the matter you raised about the Rema who wrote “and the custom developed that kaddish and leading the prayers is for eleven months in order not to make the father and mother appear as sinners because the judgment of a sinner is twelve months.” In the beginning of that statement the Rema wrote “therefore they developed the custom to recite the kaddish batra for twelve months.” This is self contradictory. These statements of the Rema have been discussed by students, and I have been asked this question by rabbinical scholars who have found this contradiction to be difficult to reconcile. But when we look at the sources the Rema quoted there are two different customs.

Once the period of reciting kaddish was reduced from twelve months to eleven months (so that the parents would not appear to be evil sinners), rabbis questioned whether one may recite the kaddish for twelve months. Some authorities ruled that if one is hired to recite the kaddish, the length of time would depend on how the request was made. For example if the child said I won’t be able to do it, therefore recite it for me, then it should be recited for eleven months. That is the period when a child recites kaddish. But if the person is hired to recite it for the dead (not instead of the child’s recitation), then it should be recited for twelve months. If he knows that the parent was in fact a sinner then kaddish must be said for twelve months. Another authority ruled that during the twelfth month the son can lead the prayer service occasionally and recite the kaddish derabbanan thereby not transgressing the twelve month custom mentioned by the Rema. Others state that where it is customary for one to recite kaddish while leading the service even though his parents are alive, it is permissible to recite the kaddish in the twelfth month, and it will not make the parents appear to be sinners, because other members of the congregation are also reciting kaddish.

This is what the Hida wrote in shiyurai brakha 376 :8 in accordance with what was said by the Ari: Because the kaddish helps to raise the soul in heaven it seems that kaddish should be recited for twelve months, but because of the [opinion of the] public - he should finish a week early.
changed to eleven months because of the belief that recitation of the kaddish helps the departed in their heavenly judgment, and that judgment lasts only eleven months for everyone but the evil people. Therefore saying kaddish for twelve months would reflect badly on the departed. However there are situations where we can permit the child to say it for twelve months.

**AUTHORITIES WHO HAD PROBLEMS WITH THIS APPROACH**

There were those who objected to the idea that the recitation of kaddish helps mitigate the judgment of the deceased.

Those who think that they will benefit from the actions and prayers of their children and relatives, done on their behalf after their death, are entertaining mistaken and vain thoughts, according to all the Rabbis and scholars...and nowhere in the Torah is there anything that can be understood to mean that the deeds of the living in this world can benefit the dead.

For the father who commands his son to fulfill a particular commandment, and the son fulfills it, it is of greater worth than the recitation of the kaddish. The same is true for daughters. For the kaddish is not a prayer of the son on behalf of his father to God to have the father’s soul brought up from sheol, but rather it is a recognition of the merits of the father when his son sanctifies God’s name in public and has the congregation respond with praising God by saying אמן יהא שםיה רבה מברך.

Elyakim b. Joseph (died ca. 1150 in Mayence), called “Ravya,” (see footnote 20) expresses a similar view in his notes. “It is not as generally accepted” he writes, “that through the recitation of the kaddish the son brings his father and mother to Paradise, and that he who frequently repeats the kaddish atones by that action for the sins of his parents and helps them to enter into the future world. For there is no foundation for the view that the kaddish is for mourners. There is no basis for it in either the Jerusalem or the Babylonian Talmud or in the Tosefta. The only source is the legend of Rabbi Akiba, and we do not base laws upon legends...”

Some rabbis asked: If the recitation of kaddish during the first year after death helps mitigate the judgment of the dead, why recite it on the anniversary of the death? Why not permit daughters or

---

18. אברתים בן נחמן, תנגו נפשות מחוקי הרממאן ד”ל בל
19. אברתים גורביץ, י”ל ו”ל, מחוקי המפורש
20. A.Z. Idelsohn, Jewish Liturgy and its Development, p.87. Rabbi David Golinkin pointed out to us, based on Berliner 90-91, that Idelsohn confused the Ra’aviyah with the “author of Ra’aviah” who lived in the 19th century, Rabbi Efraim Elyakim Getzel.
other relatives to recite it?\textsuperscript{21}

But retribution that he owes to God due to the fact that he transgressed the \textit{mitzvot} is like all other transgressions, and it is surely not in the power of humans to lessen the punishment. But if a righteous person asks for mercy or gives charity to the poor (for the sake of the deceased), perhaps God will lessen the punishment because of the merit of the righteous person.

But since the Rabbis, may their memories be for a blessing, said that a son can bring merit to the father, we are forced to explain that it isn’t in the power of a person to lessen the punishment of the dead except for the sons because the merit of the son is a merit for the parents themselves who gave birth to worthy children. Following this point of view, one can say that not only do they save them from the judgment of \textit{gehinom} but they also raise them up to where the righteous are. But it is a little difficult to understand why this belief was applied specifically to the recitation of the \textit{kaddish}. The same should apply to the recitation of any verses that contain praise and thanksgiving to God or the study of \textit{Torah} or the performance of a \textit{mitzvah}. And in the \textit{kaddish} itself, the person who responds \textit{amen} is greater than the person who recites the blessing, because the rabbis said “greater is the person who answers \textit{amen} than the person making the blessing.”

\textbf{OTHER REASONS FOR THE RECITATION OF KADDISH}

The main reason (for reciting \textit{kaddish}) is that there is no death without sin and most people die due to the sin of desecration of God’s name, for which there is no absolution for that sin until they die. When God exacts retribution from the sinner, then God’s name is sanctified etc.

\textsuperscript{21}\textit{Bacharach}, 222 (see \textit{Louis Jacobs Theology in the Rersponsa}, p.168) and \textit{Hayyim} Vol. IV, 
\textit{Orah Hayyim}, no. 7 (\textit{Jacobs} p.271)

\textsuperscript{22}\textit{Shirha'ah}, 72 (see \textit{Shi'ur ha-\textit{kaddish},} (\textit{Magen Avraham} 66:863) (\textit{Bacharach} 222)

\textsuperscript{23}\textit{Kitzur Shulhan Arukh}, no. 114 (\textit{Orah Hayyim} 58)

\textsuperscript{24}\textit{Acharon Shelanu} 148, 128
Therefore, the son of that sinner who died stands and, as the leader of the service, says *yitgadal veyitkadosh shemay rabba* - that is to say. I am comforted about my father's death, because the name of my Father in Heaven (God) is magnified and sanctified by my own father's death, and my father's sin of desecrating God's name is absolved. This is similar to those judged by courts, where the family has been forced to say that the court judged well, in order to show that they don't hold a grudge against the court.

Rabbi Uziel gives another reason for the recitation of *kaddish* and for having the children of the deceased lead the service and that reason is: absolving the father and themselves from the sin of not having the proper intention when hearing someone recite a blessing and reciting amen. We do not understand the mystery of the recitation of *kaddish*...but the customs of our people are *Torah* and we should follow the custom.25

From the above sources we see that various reasons were given for the recitation of the *kaddish* for different lengths of time. When a particular reason was no longer acceptable or it presented a problem, a new reason was advanced and accepted. It is also clear that the original custom was to recite the *kaddish* for twelve months and was changed to eleven months only later.

**Kaddish In Contemporary Thought**

In our generation it is inconsistent to retain a custom based upon a legend that claims that our actions can save our deceased parents from divine punishment. We also know that this legend contradicts an important Jewish value that we embrace, namely that each person is responsible for his/her atonement.

Because of the compelling role that the recitation of *kaddish* plays in Jewish life, it is important that we find reasons and rationales for the recitation of *kaddish* that are theologically and emotionally consistent with our ideas and beliefs. In the following contemporary expressions of the significance of reciting *kaddish* we see that kaddish recitation has a powerful emotional and spiritual affect on the mourner. This should compel us to reorient what we teach concerning the role of *kaddish* from its benefit to the deceased to the benefit for the mourner.

26 הקש מיהו הר חק יوتر אמיין שמאאום את הודי הצעיר עלה את אחרים ואמה הקדיש.

The strongest and most powerful connection that unites the young generation to its people and to its *Torah* is the *kaddish*.

The *Kaddish* evokes a stronger emotional response in Jews than any other prayer in our liturgy....Some Jews who otherwise do not adhere to other Jewish traditions faithfully say the
Before my father’s death, my daily worship was non existent. My attendance at synagogue fell into the category of yearly....After the Shiva period ended, I was faced with living up to the commitment I had made to my father to say Kaddish for him....As the days went by, I began to understand the purpose of the Kaddish service and feel its effect on me. I thought about my father every day. I began and ended my day with a peaceful meditation and “conversation” with my God....Some of the mystery surrounding prayers, holidays , and traditions began to disappear...

The Kaddish experience acted not only as a healing exercise, but a strengthening bond between myself, my father, my grandfather, and those who preceded them. I am more aware that there is more to being Jewish than Bris, Bar Mitzvah and burial. A great deal is available in between, if we take the time to look for it.28

Rising to recite Kaddish gave me some way to express my love for my mother and to receive comfort. I soon saw this act as a way of bearing witness that love is as strong as death (Song of Songs 8:6).29

Kaddish means “sanctification.” From beginning to end, the Kaddish sanctifies the name of God, thus attesting our total submission to, and acceptance of, His will. Despite our loss, we are among those who praise God’s name.30

The Kaddish proclaims further that this is a “world He created according to His will.” Though sorrow may temporarily dull our vision or threaten to rob life of meaning, we affirm that there is a plan and a purpose to life because there is a God at the heart of it.31

The kaddish offers the reassurance that God can provide inner peace and serenity—the mourner’s most desperate needs. “May He who ordains harmony in the universe grant peace to us...”32

The Kaddish challenges the mourner to work for the fashioning of a better world. ..’May He establish His kingdom...”...This ought not remain a passive hope.33

It joins us to our people. It adjusts our perspective. It fortifies our faith. It reassures us with a promise of inner peace. It summons us to labor for a better world.34

The essential question is broached by Rabbi David Abramson, in a sermon written during his period of reciting kaddish for his father. “Do mourners say kaddish for their loved ones or for...
themselves? The answer to the paradoxical question is both. I do not subscribe to the superstitious notion that, on a metaphysical level, recitation benefits our loved ones directly, elevating them more and more in heaven, but there is no doubt in my mind that recitation of kaddish is a powerful act of tribute to our loved ones. On one level, I believe, we do owe it to them. More important than that, is the power that the regular recitation of the Mourner’s Kaddish has on the mourner himself or herself. I’ve written and spoken of this extensively and won’t belabor the point here. Suffice it to say that I understand, more than I ever did before, the profound healing power of the Kaddish.\textsuperscript{35}

**Summary**

There are different customs and reasons for the recitation of kaddish. The original custom, as stated by the Rema (see above footnote 9) was to recite it for twelve months which is the period of mourning for a parent. At a later date the custom developed to recite kaddish for eleven months based upon the idea that we recite kaddish to help the dead receive a better judgement in the world to come. For those who feel that the concept of individual responsibility is paramount, we should not be bound to the latter custom that is based upon a legend concerning the ability of our acts to save our loved ones from divine punishment. There is considerable debate over this issue in the sources mentioned above. Rather, the rabbi in teaching new mourners about their obligations should stress the positive spiritual benefits of Kaddish recitation for the mourner in place of the benefit for the deceased. Therefore, it would be appropriate that the Kaddish be recited for a period of twelve months.

**Psak**

The original custom of twelve month Kaddish recitation for a parent should be reinstated and taught as a valid alternative to the current custom of eleven month recitation. The period of aveilut for a parent is twelve months. Just as the kaddish is recited for the full period of aveilut for all others but parents, namely 30 days, so should the period of recitation of kaddish for a parent conform to the the period of aveilut for a parent, namely twelve months. In order to give significance to the first Yartzeit so that it doesn't appear to be part of the twelve month recitation of kaddish, some people may choose not to recite kaddish on the day before the first yarhtzeit.

\textsuperscript{35} http://www.bnaiemet.org/ColumnR/from_the_rabbi.htm

\textbackslash raserver03\folderredirects\marad\desktop\plavin-rabinowitz_kaddish_alternative.rtf